DISTRICT	OFF.		CKET NO. NUMBER	OR	MO.		YR.	J	NATURE SUIT	DIV.	R 23	\$ DEMAND THOUSANDS	JUDGE		COUNTY	JURY DEM.	DOCKET YR. NUMBER
<b>0</b> 977	06	90	Case 00046		-cv-(	)0040 11	5-CC 90		ocun 893	ient 1	File	ed 02/0	6/14 7709	Page 1	30049		90 46-H
DI AINTIFFS							İ	.!					DEEE	NDANTS			

PLAINTIFFS

DEFENDANTS

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA (EPA)

ASARCO, INC.

Environmental Matter (CERCLA)

CAUSE
(CITE THE U.S. CIVIL STATUTE UNDER WHICH THE CASE IS FILED AND WRITE A BRIEF STATEMENT OF CAUSE)

**ATTORNEYS** 

LORRAINE GALLINGER
Assistant US Attorney
PO Box 1478
Billings, MT 59103
(406) 657-6101

Peter W. Downing, Scott S. Barker, Cynthia S. Leap Holland and Hart Suite 2900 555 Seventeenth Street Denver, CO 80201 (303) 295-8000

for ASARCO

Michael D. Goodstein
Environmental Enforcement Section
U.S. Department of Justice
P. O. Box 7611, Ben Franklin Station
Washington, D.C. 20044
(202) 514-1111

CC3:1:32796

CHECK		STATISTICAL CARDS			
HERE IF CASE WAS	DATE	RECEIPT NUMBER	C.D. NUMBER	CARD	DATE MAILED
FILED IN	9-11-90	N/A USA exempt		JS-5 JS-6	1 <b>0</b> -90
FORMA PAUPERIS					

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DOCKET

DC-111 (Rev. 8/87)

		·
DATE	NR.	UNITED STATES (EPA) v. Document 1 Filed 02/06/14 Page 2 of 15
9-11-90	1	CIVIL COVER SHEET COMPLAINT
		SUMMONS issued, handed 0 + 3 along w/2 conformed copy of complaint & form 285 to USM for service.  LODGED Consent Decree
9-20-90	2	SUMMONS issued to ASARCO returned as served on William O. Hart on ,9-14-90.
10-5-90	3	JOINT MOTION FOR STY signed by cnsl of record w/cs. dm LODGED proposed order for stay. dm
10/12/90	4	ORDER that this action is stayed until further order of the court. Nothing herein shall prevent either party from moving to lift the stay upon a showing of good cause cc: Stewart, Holland & Hart, Gallagher, CCL (bf)
11-20-90	5	USA & ASARCO's motion for entry of consent decreesigned by cnsl of record. dm + separately bound attacking for
Mrset.	te. De	cele
wrajel.		
12-27-90 12-27-90		ORDER - the mtn for entry of the consent decree is GRANTED. Copies to Gallinger, Downing, Goldstein, CCL, Tami. CONSENT DECREE. J/O Book, Vol 9, Page 9. Copies to Gallinger, Downing, Goldstein. dm
		held Interest
4/5/95		STIP OF COMPROMISE AND APPVL, re US and ASARCO agree to settle potential stipulated penalties claim of US agnst ASARCO under consent decree enter 12/27/90. W/in 30 days of appvl of this stip, ASARCO shall pay \$3,000 to US in full and complete satisfaction of any potential clam of US agnst ASARCO for stip penalties under consent decree re Bill No 4T033.cc: Gallinger, Goodstein, Althoff
<b>9/23/96</b> 2/9/04 3/20/04	-   -   -	File Sent to Records Center, 021-97-0011, Box 7 File requested from Rec Center to copy docs. File returned to Rec Center.
4/28/10	9	Stipulation to Substitute Parties In 1990 Consent Decree; lodged Order
5/3/10	10	arder granting Stip to Substitute Parties
		,
1		

MICHAEL D. GOODSTEIN Environmental Enforcement Section U.S. Department of Justice Be Franklin Station P.O. Box 7611 Washington, D.C. 20044 (202) 514-1111

LORRAINE D. GALLINGER
Assistant United States Attorney
P.O. Box 1478
Billings, Montana 59103
(406) 657-6101
LCDGED

Hallinger Loodstein althoff (Wolland: Wart)

Mr 27 12

I. T. ALTKS, CH, JR. C'EL "

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA MISSOULA DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

UNITED STATES OF STATE OF MONTANA,

Plaintiffs,

CIVIL ACTION NO.: CV 90-46-H-CCL

v.

ASARCO INCORPORATED,

Defendant.

## STIPULATION OF COMPROMISE - Copyrolul

Plaintiff United States of America and Defendant ASARCO
Incorporated hereby agree to settle a potential stipulated
penalties claim of the United States against ASARCO Incorporated
("Asarco") under the consent decree entered by the Court on
December 27, 1990.

Pursuant to the consent decree, on March 20, 1994, Asarco received Bill No. 4T033 from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency for reimbursement of costs incurred under the decree by the United States from January 1, 1993 through December 31, 1993 in the amount of \$277,785.80. In accordance with the consent

decree Bill No. 4T033 requested payment by Asarco within thirty days of receipt; Asarco mistakenly calculated the due date and disputed the entire \$277,785.80 pursuant to the dispute resolution provisions of the consent decree by letter dated April 21, 1994. Asarco ultimately paid the full amount, including accrued interest, by June 13, 1994. The United States contends that the delay in payment by Asarco of Bill 4T033 subjects Asarco to certain stipulated penalties under the consent Asarco contends that it is not subject to such decree. stipulated penalties. Without any admissions of law or fact, the United States and Asarco agree to resolve the potential claim for stipulated penalties of the United States as follows:

Within thirty (30) days of approval of this Stipulation of Compromise by the Court, Asarco shall pay three thousand dollars (\$3,000) to the United States in full and complete satisfaction of any potential claim of the United States against Asarco for stipulated penalties under the consent decree regarding Bill No. Said payment shall be made in accordance with Paragraph F. of Section XV (Stipulated Penalties) of the consent decree.

Wherefore, the United States and Asarco jointly request that this Stipulation of Compromise be approved by the Court.

Respectfully submitted.

On behalf of the United States:

LOIS J. SCHIFFER

Assistant Attorney General

Environment and Natural Resources

Division

MICHAEL D. GOODSTEIN

Environmental Enforcement Section

U.S. Department of Justice

Ben Franklin Station

P.O. Box 7611

Washington, D.C. 20044

(202) 514-1111

SHERRY SCHEEL MATTEUCCI United States Attorney District of Montana

Assistant United States Attorney

P.O. Box 1478

Billings, Montana 59103

(406) 657-6101

On behalf of ASARCO Incorporated:

HOLLAND & HART Attorneys at Law

MARGARET ALTHOFF

P.O. Box 8749

Denver, Colorado 80201-8749

(303) 295-8486

DATED:

DAY OF

425018.1

3.

# LODGED.90-cv-00046-CCL Document 1 Filed 02/06/14 Page 6 of 15

APR 2 8 2010

PATRICK E. DUFFY, CLERK IN THE UNITED S	TATES DISTRICT COURT
DEPUTY CLERK, HELENA FOR THE DIST	TRICT OF MONTANA FILED
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	) MAY 0 3 2010
Plaintiff,	PATRICK E. DUFFY, CLERK  By#10 &A  DEPUTY CLERK, HELENA
v.	Civil Action No. CV-90-46-H-CCL
ASARCO INCORPORATED,	) )
Defendant.	)

## ORDER GRANTING STIPULATION TO SUBSTITUTE PARTIES IN 1990 CONSENT DECREE

Upon consideration of the Parties' Joint Motion and Stipulated Order to Amend 1990 Consent Decree to Substitute Parties (the "Motion") and it appearing that the Court has jurisdiction over this matter,

IT IS ORDERED that the Motion is GRANTED and the 1990 Consent Decree is amended to:

- 1. Substitute Montana Environmental Trust Group, LLC (not individually but solely in its representative capacity as Custodial Trustee of the Custodial Trust) for ASARCO Inc. and ASARCO LLC in the 1998 Consent Decree, and
- 2. Remove ASARCO Inc. and ASARCO LLC as parties to the 1990 Consent Decree, under which ASARCO Inc. and ASARCO LLC will not longer be liable.

x 1

Case 6:90-cv-00046-CCL Document 1 Filed 02/06024 Page 7 of 15

IT IS SO ORDERED.

C: Bragory Evans Cepathia Brooks Mare Wenveich Elliot Rockler Reif Johnson

# **FILED**

JOHN C. CRUDEN

Deputy Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division United States Department of Justice

PATRICK E. DUFFY, CLERK

APR 2 8 2010

#### ELLIOT M. ROCKLER

Environmental Enforcement Section United States Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611 601 D Street, N.W., Room 2121 Washington, DC 20044-7611

Phone: (202) 514-2653 Fax: (202) 616-6583

Email: elliot.rockler@usdoj.gov

#### WILLIAM W. MERCER

United States Attorney District of Montana

#### **LEIF JOHNSON**

Assistant United States Attorney District of Montana P.O. Box 1478 Billings, Montana 59103 (406) 657-6101

Attorneys for the United States

### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA MISSOULA DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, Plaintiff, v.	) ) )
ASARCO INCORPORATED,	Civil Action No. CV-90-46-H-CCL
Defendant.	) ) , '

#### STIPULATION TO SUBSTITUTE PARTIES IN 1990 CONSENT DECREE

The plaintiff, United States of America, the defendant, ASARCO, and the Montana Environmental Trust Group, LLC, not individually but solely in its representative capacity as Trustee of the Montana Environmental Custodial Trust (the "Trustee of the Custodial Trust"), in contemplation of the termination of the 1990 Consent Decree and in furtherance of the settlement reached in ASARCO's bankruptcy proceeding, stipulate and agree to the substitution of the Trustee of the Custodial Trust for the benefit of the Plaintiff and the State of Montana, for ASARCO in the above captioned case as follows:

The United States of America filed a complaint in this matter against ASARCO<sup>1</sup> under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act ("CERCLA"), seeking injunctive relief and recovery of response costs in connection with the East Helena Site owned and operated by ASARCO. An order granting the joint motion for entry of a consent decree was issued by the Court on December 27, 1990 ("1990 Consent Decree").

On August 9, 2005, ASARCO filed a petition under Chapter 11 of the Bankruptcy Code in the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Southern District of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> ASARCO Inc. changed its name to ASARCO LLC in 2005. All references to "ASARCO" refer to ASARCO Inc., ASARCO LLC, or both, as appropriate.

Texas ("Bankruptcy Court") in a pending case jointly administered as Case No. 05-21207 (together with all jointly administered cases, the "Bankruptcy Case").

The United States filed claims and protective claims in the Bankruptcy Case relating to ASARCO's environmental liabilities under the 1990 Consent Decree.

ASARCO and the United States have agreed upon a settlement of these claims and protective claims.

The settlement includes the East Helena Site and provides for the establishment of the Custodial Trust under the confirmation of a plan of reorganization. On the Effective Date, as that term is defined in the applicable documents, title to various property was transferred to the Custodial Trust and the Custodial Trust was funded in the amount of the agreed upon settlement. Upon transfer of title and funding, the trust was made the owner of the property and is now liable for completion of environmental tasks with respect to the property solely to the extent of available funds in the East Helena Designated Property Custodial Trust Cleanup Account under the settlement agreement and realty resources comprising the East Helena Designated Property. ASARCO is no longer liable for any tasks remaining under the 1990 Consent Decree. One of the terms of the settlement agreement states that ASARCO shall be removed as a party to the 1990 Consent Decree on the Effective Date.

On November 13, 2009, the district court presiding over the Bankruptcy Case entered an order, as modified on December 3, 2009, confirming the plan of reorganization submitted by ASARCO's parent, ASARCO Incorporated and Americas Mining Corporation. The Effective Date occurred on December 9, 2009.

Based on the above, ASARCO, the United States of America, and the Trustee of the Custodial Trust hereby stipulate and request that this Court enter an order directing that:

- 1. Montana Environmental Trust Group, LLC (not individually but solely in its representative capacity as Trustee of the Montana Environmental Custodial Trust) is substituted for ASARCO in the 1990 Consent Decree for the benefit of the United States and the State of Montana; and
- 2. ASARCO is removed as a party to the 1990 Consent Decree and will no longer be liable for any tasks remaining thereunder.

Respectfully submitted this 27<sup>th</sup> day of April 2010.

FOR THE PLAINTIFF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

By: List Cockles Date: 4/27/10
Elliot M. Rockler

Trial Attorney

**Environmental Enforcement Section** 

Environment and Natural Resources Division

United States Department of Justice

FOR THE DEFENDANT ASA	RCO/LLC:								
By:	Uu Date:	January	4,	2010					
Manuel E. Ramos – /									
Chief Executive Officer and	President								
^ /									
By: OSCAR CONTAI	ST Date:	January	4,	2010					
Oscar Gonzalez Barron									
Vice President, Chief Finance	cial Officer								

#### FOR THE CUSTODIAL TRUST:

Montana Environmental Trust Group, LLC, not individually but solely in its representative capacity as Trustee of the Montana Environmental Custodial Trust

By: Freenfield Environmental Trust Group, Inc., Member

Cynthia Brooks, not individually but solely as President

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 27, 2010 the foregoing STIPULATION TO SUBSTITUTE PARTIES IN 1990 CONSENT DECREE and proposed Order were electronically served upon the following:

Gregory Evans
Alisa Schlesinger
Milbank | Litigation
601 South Figueroa Street
Los Angeles, California 90017
Email: gevans@milbank.com
aschlesinger@milbank.com

Cynthia Brooks
President
Greenfield Environmental Trust Group, Inc.
PO Box 487
Chestnut Hill, MA 02467
Email: cb@g-etg.com

Marc Weinreich
Montana Environmental Trust Group, LLC
Vice President
Greenfield Environmental Trust Group, Inc.
PO Box 487
Chestnut Hill, MA 02467
Email: mw@g-etg.com

Counsel for the United States